

District: City of North Adams
 School Name: Greylock Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: December 6, 2023

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of North Adams (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Greylock Elementary School and Brayton Elementary School with a new consolidated facility for 240 students in Kindergarten through Grade 2, plus Pre-kindergarten, at the existing Greylock Elementary School site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s Preferred Schematic.

District Information	
District Name	City of North Adams
Elementary Schools	Brayton Elementary School (PK-6) Colegrove Park Elementary School (PK-6) Greylock Elementary School (PK-6)
Middle Schools	N/A
High School	Drury High School (7-12)
Priority School Name	Greylock Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	PK-6
Year Opened	1953
Existing Square Footage	55,000
Additions	1965 – Addition
Acreage of Site	3.6 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mechanical systems • Electrical systems • Envelope • Windows • Roof • Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program, as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2022-2023 Enrollment	252
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 265 students (K-6) • 240 students (K-2) (Preferred Schematic)
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the Preferred Schematic, the District will sign a Design Enrollment

District Information	
	Certification for 240 students in grades K-2, for a project that will serve grades PK-2.
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	December 11, 2019
Invitation to Feasibility Study	August 25, 2021
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On December 13, 2023 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on June 26, 2024
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	80.00%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	Colliers Project Leaders USA NE, LLC
Designer	TSKP Studio, LLC

Discussion

As part of the Feasibility Study the MSBA accepted the District’s request to explore the following two study enrollment options, both of which consider consolidation between the existing Greylock and Brayton Elementary School’s population:

- Enrollment 1: Grades K-6 for 265 students
- Enrollment 2: Grades K-2 for 240 students

The existing Greylock Elementary School is a 55,000 square foot facility located on a 12.3-acre site that currently serves students in pre-kindergarten through grade 6. The original school building was constructed in 1951 with an addition in 1964.

The District’s Statement of Interest (“SOI”) identified numerous deficiencies in the existing facility associated with outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope; accessibility issues; and existing spaces that are not conducive for delivering the District’s educational program.

The existing Brayton Elementary School is a 97,000 square foot facility located on a 5.2-acre site that also currently serves students in pre-kindergarten through grade 6. The original school building was constructed in 1994.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied (10) preliminary options that included (2) code upgrade options, (4) addition/renovation options, and (4) new construction options, as presented below.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
Option 0A	Code upgrade at the existing Greylock Elementary School with an estimated project cost of approximately \$39.2 million.
Option 0B	Code upgrade at the existing Brayton Elementary School with an estimated project cost of approximately \$50.5 million.
Option 1A	Renovation for 240 students in kindergarten through grade 2, plus pre-kindergarten, at the existing Brayton Elementary School; with an estimated project cost range of approximately \$55-70 million.
Option 1B	Renovation for 265 students in kindergarten through grade 6, plus pre-kindergarten, at the existing Brayton Elementary School; with an estimated project cost range of approximately \$55-70 million.
Option 2A	New construction for 240 students in kindergarten through grade 2, plus pre-kindergarten, at the existing Brayton Elementary School site; with an estimated project cost range of approximately \$75-85 million.
Option 2B	New construction for 265 students in kindergarten through grade 6, plus pre-kindergarten, at the existing Brayton Elementary School site; with an estimated project cost range of approximately \$75-85 million.
Option 3A	Addition/renovation for 240 students in kindergarten through grade 2, plus pre-kindergarten, at the existing Greylock Elementary School; with an estimated project cost range of approximately \$60-75 million.
Option 3B	Addition/renovation for 265 students in kindergarten through grade 6, plus pre-kindergarten, at the existing Greylock Elementary School; with an estimated project cost range of approximately \$60-75 million.
Option 4A	New construction for 240 students in kindergarten through grade 2, plus pre-kindergarten, at the existing Greylock Elementary School site; with an estimated project cost range of approximately \$75-90 million.
Option 4B	New construction for 265 students in kindergarten through grade 6, plus pre-kindergarten, at the existing Greylock Elementary School site; with an estimated project cost range of approximately \$75-90 million.

As a result of this analysis, the District determined that “Options 2A and 2B” would not be considered for further evaluation because the District determined that the Brayton Elementary School site was too compact and complicated to support these two options, which proposed to locate a primarily new building on sloping areas of the site.

Subsequent to the preliminary evaluation of alternatives, the District selected to move forward with re-organizing its elementary schools by grade span. Therefore, the future enrollment of the Greylock/Brayton Elementary Schools would result in a single facility for pre-kindergarten through grade 2 and the Colegrove Elementary School would result in a configuration for grades 3-6. As a result of this decision, “Options 1B, 3B, and 4B” (pre-kindergarten through grades 6 options) would not be considered for further evaluation.

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to (5) options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below, including: (2) code upgrade options, (1) renovation option, (1) addition/renovation option, and (1) new construction option.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 0A: (Code Upgrade at the Brayton Elementary School – 240 students PK-2)	97,000	97,000 \$449/sq. ft.	N/A	\$2,744,323	\$46,367,813 \$478/sq. ft.	\$55,641,576
Option 0B: (Code Upgrade at the Greylock Elementary School – 240 students PK-2)	55,000	55,000 \$561/sq. ft.	N/A	\$3,125,495	\$33,967,293 \$618/sq. ft.	\$40,7960,582
Option 1A: (Renovation at the Brayton Elementary School – 240 students PK-2)	80,700	80,700 \$481/sq. ft.	N/A	\$6,334,427	\$45,261,959 \$561/sq. ft.	\$60,884,516
Option 3A: (Addition/ renovation at the Greylock Elementary School– 240 students PK-2)	75,900	43,200 \$473/sq. ft.	32,700 \$683/sq. ft.	\$5,865,569	\$48,619,652 \$641/sq. ft.	\$59,651,122
Option 4A:*** (New Construction at the Greylock Elementary School site – 240 students PK-2)	73,000	N/A	73,000 \$591/sq. ft.	\$7,884,611	\$50,995,491 \$699/sq. ft.	\$61,380,263
Option 4B: (New Construction at the Greylock Elementary School site – 265 students PK-6) Cost Comparison Only	86,000	N/A	86,000 \$702/sq. ft.	\$13,196,693	\$73,525,693 \$855/sq. ft.	\$87,942,818

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

*****District's Preferred Schematic**

The District has selected “Option 4A” as the Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design as the District determined that this option best meets the needs of the District’s educational program and aligns with the District’s decision to move forward grade span schools and is anticipated to minimize disruption to ongoing education during construction. Additionally, the site is more centrally located within the District and accessible by public transportation. Further, the District determined that this option maximizes community support and provides desired community access to the gymnasium and cafeteria and takes advantage of the site’s adjacency to the Alcombright Athletic Complex.

“Option 0A” was not selected by the District because the District determined that the existing Brayton Elementary School facility is oversized for the proposed program and lacks adequate daylight to many of its academic spaces.

“Option 0B” was not selected by the District because the District determined that the existing Greylock Elementary School facility does not meet the goals of the District’s educational program

and it was determined that the existing facility is insufficiently sized to support the proposed program and to accommodate additional students.

“Option 1A” was not selected by the District because the District determined that the existing Brayton Elementary School facility and site present a number of challenges. The District identified challenges associated with a building that is oversized for the proposed program and lacks adequate daylight to many of its academic spaces. Additionally, the District indicated that the site contains a challenging topography, lacks outdoor recreational space, possesses circulation concerns as a result of sharing the site with an existing YMCA program, and has environmental constraints associated with the proximity to an existing brook. Further, the District determined that this option would require relocating students during construction.

“Option 3A” was not selected by the District because the District determined that this option would require students to be relocated during construction, and the District indicated that a proposed north facing main entrance was undesirable. Additionally, the District indicated that this option does not achieve a consistent level of sustainability when compared to the District’s Preferred Schematic.

“Option 4B” was not selected by the District because the District determined that this option does not align with the District’s decision to move forward with re-organizing its elementary schools by grade span; however, this option was included for cost comparison purposes only.

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on November 15, 2023. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed the following items: appreciation of the District’s thorough educational program; the proposed building’s logical and welcoming design; appreciation of the separation of public spaces from the academic wing; distribution of Special Education spaces and DESE submittal process; location and use of the proposed breakout spaces; utilization of the courtyard and its connection to the educational program; consideration of looping for first and second grades; further development of the cafeteria and creating intentional visual connections to the courtyard and second floor; building massing; the proposed roof lines and geometry of the building exterior and educational spaces; and, use and potential development of the community porch.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s Preferred Schematic is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District’s Special Education submission will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.

- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of North Adams be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Greylock Elementary School and Brayton Elementary School with a new consolidated facility for 240 students in Kindergarten through Grade 2, plus Pre-kindergarten, at the existing Greylock Elementary School site.