District: Town of Burlington

School Name: Fox Hill Elementary School

Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic Date: February 21, 2024

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Burlington (the "District") to proceed into Schematic Design as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study. This is to replace the existing Fox Hill Elementary School with a new facility serving kindergarten through grade 5 on the existing site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District's Preferred Schematic.

District Information			
District Name	Town of Burlington		
Elementary Schools	Memorial Elementary School (K-5)		
	Fox Hill Elementary School (K-5)		
	Francis Wyman Elementary School (K-5)		
	Pine Glen Elementary School (K-5)		
Middle School	Marshall Simonds Middle School (6-8)		
High School	Burlington High School (PK, 9-12)		
Priority School Name	Fox Hill Elementary School		
Type of School	Elementary School		
Grades Served	K-5		
Year Opened	1967		
Existing Square Footage	64,400		
Additions	2010 – 3 modular classrooms		
Acreage of Site	37.9 acres		
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas:		
	 Structural integrity 		
	 Mechanical systems 		
	 Electrical systems 		
	 Plumbing systems 		
	Envelope		
	- Windows		
	- Roof		
	Accessibility		
	In addition to the physical plant issues, the District		
	reported that the existing facility does not support the		
	delivery of its educational program as well as existing and		
	projected overcrowding.		
Original Design Capacity	Unknown		
2023-2024 Enrollment	455		
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations:		
	- 325 students at Fox Hill Elementary School (grade		
	configuration K-5) (Preferred Schematic)		

District Information					
	 640 students at a consolidated Fox Hill Elementary 				
	School and Pine Glen Elementary School (grade				
	configuration K-5)				
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board's approval of the Preferred				
-	Schematic, the District will sign a Design Enrollment				
	Certification for 325 students in grades K-5.				
Total Project Budget – Debt	Yes				
Exclusion Anticipated					

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	April 14, 2021
Invitation to Feasibility Study	April 27, 2022
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On February 28, 2024 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on
	August 28, 2024
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate	45.52%
(Incentive points are not applicable)	

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager (the "OPM")	Dore & Whittier Management Partners, Inc.
Designer	DiNisco Design, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Fox Hill Elementary School is a 64,400 square-foot facility located on a 37.9-acre site, currently serving students in kindergarten through grade 5. The original building was constructed in 1967, with three modular classrooms added in 2010.

The District's Statement of Interest ("SOI") identified numerous deficiencies in the existing facility associated with outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope; accessibility issues; and deficiencies in existing spaces that are deemed incapable of appropriately delivering the District's educational program.

As part of the Feasibility Study, the MSBA accepted the District's request to explore options that included a consolidation of the Fox Hill Elementary School and the Pine Glen Elementary School student populations.

The existing Pine Glen Elementary School is a 58,000 square-foot facility located on an 11.8-acre site, currently serving students in kindergarten through grade 5. The building was constructed in 1962, with an elevator and teacher's dining room added in 2004.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program, receiving input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied twelve (12) preliminary options including: two (2) code upgrade options, three (3) addition/renovation options, and seven (7) new construction options. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary options considered:

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
Option 1	Code upgrade only at the existing Fox Hill Elementary School for 325 students
Орион 1	in grades K-5; with an estimated project cost \$61 million.
Option 2	Addition/renovation at the existing Fox Hill Elementary School for 325 students
Option 2	in grades K-5; with an estimated project cost of \$113 million.
	New construction of a 3-story building on the eastern part of the Fox Hill
Option 3A	Elementary School site for 325 students in grades K-5; with an estimated project
	cost of \$102 million.
	New construction of a 3-story building on the northern part of the Fox Hill
Option 3B	Elementary School site for 325 students in grades K-5; with an estimated project
	cost of \$102 million.
	New construction of a 2-story building on the eastern part of the Fox Hill
Option 3C	Elementary School site for 325 students in grades K-5; with an estimated project
	cost of \$102 million.
	New construction of a 2-story building on the northern part of the Fox Hill
Option 3D	Elementary School site for 325 students in grades K-5; with an estimated project
	cost of \$102 million.
Option 4	Code upgrade only of the existing Fox Hill Elementary School for 640 students
1	in grades K-5; with an estimated project costs \$62 million.
Option 5	Addition/renovation of the existing Fox Hill Elementary School for 640 students
1	in grades K-5; with an estimated project cost of \$155 million.
	New construction of a 3-story building on the eastern part of the Fox Hill
Option 6A	Elementary School site for 640 students in grades K-5; with an estimated project
	cost of \$145 million.
	New construction of a 3-story building on the northern part of the Fox Hill
Option 6B	Elementary School site for 640 students in grades K-5; with an estimated project
	cost of \$145 million. Addition/growystian at the existing Pine Glan Flamentary School for 640.
Option 7	Addition/renovation at the existing Pine Glen Elementary School for 640
	students in grades K-5; with an estimated project cost of \$144 million. New construction at the existing Pine Glen Elementary School site for 640
Option 8	
	students in grades K-5; with an estimated project cost of \$141 million.

As a result of this analysis, the District determined that all twelve (12) options would be considered for further evaluation.

Following the evaluation of preliminary options, for cost comparison purposes only, the District developed a code upgrade-only option at the Pine Glen Elementary School, referred to as "Option 9."

MSBA staff and the District agreed to explore the following thirteen (13) options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing, as presented below, including: three (3) code upgrade options, three (3) addition/renovation options, and seven (7) new construction options.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Options 1 (Code upgrade at the existing Fox Hill ES for 325 students)	64,400	64,400 \$495/sq. ft.	N/A	\$5,431,023	\$37,309,023 \$579/sq. ft.	\$47,100,000
Option 2 (Addition/ renovation at the Fox Hill ES site for 325 students)	88,700	26,900 \$588/sq. ft.	61,800 \$755/sq. ft.	\$18,655,717	\$81,131,917 \$914/sq. ft.	\$102,500,000
Option 3A (New construction at the Fox Hill ES site for 325 students; 3-story)	91,000	N/A	91,000 \$694/sq. ft.	\$17,788,471	\$80,942,471 \$889/sq. ft.	\$102,200,000
Option 3B (New construction at the Fox Hill ES site for 325 students; 3-story)	91,000	N/A	91,000 \$699/sq. ft.	\$15,907,308	\$79,516,308 \$873/sq. ft.	\$100,400,000
Option 3C (New construction at the Fox Hill ES site for 325 students; 2-story)	91,000	N/A	91,000 \$690/sq. ft.	\$17,882,191	\$80,672,191 \$886/sq. ft.	\$101,900,000
Option 3D*** (New construction at the Fox Hill ES site for 325 students; 2-story)	91,000	N/A	91,000 \$679/sq. ft.	\$17,193,675	\$78,982,675 \$868/sq. ft.	\$99,800,000
Options 4 (Code upgrade at the existing Fox Hill ES for 640 students)	64,400	64,400 \$495/sq. ft.	N/A	\$5,431,023	\$37,309,023 \$579/sq. ft.	\$47,100,000
Option 5 (Addition/ Renovation at the Fox Hill ES; 640 students)	169,600	32,500 \$547/sq. ft.	137,100 \$700/sq. ft.	\$19,145,505	\$132,893,000 \$886/sq. ft.	\$101,900,000
Option 6A (New construction at the Fox Hill ES site for 640 students; 3-story)	155,000	N/A	155,000 \$654/sq. ft.	\$18,332,591	\$119,702,591 \$772/sq. ft.	\$151,200,000
Option 6B (New construction at the Fox Hill ES site for 640 students; 3-story)	155,000	N/A	155,000 \$643/sq. ft.	\$18,375,882	\$118,040,882 \$762/sq. ft.	\$149,100,000

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 7 (Addition/ Renovation at the Pine Glen ES; 640 students)	154,500	41,000 \$621/sq. ft.	113,500 \$699/sq. ft.	\$16,249,270	\$121,046,770 \$783/sq. ft.	\$152,900,000
Option 8 (New construction at the Pine Glen ES site for 640 students; 3-story)	155,000	N/A	155,000 \$634/sq. ft.	\$16,060,654	\$114,330,654 \$738/sq. ft.	\$144,400,000
Option 9 (Code upgrade at the existing Pine Glen ES for cost comparison purposes only)	58,000	58,000 \$495/sf	N/A	\$5,347,823	\$34,141,023 \$589/sf	\$47,000,000

^{*} Marked up construction costs

The District has chosen "Option 3D" as the Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design. This decision was based on the District determining that this option (1) estimates to be the most cost-effective among the viable options, (2) best meets the needs of the District's educational program, and (3) the proposed location on site is expected to minimize disruption to ongoing education during construction. The District also indicated a preference for the adjacencies provided in the 2-story building design and this option provides ample space for outdoor use and play spaces. Additionally, the District indicated that this option aligns with the community's desire to maintain four neighborhood elementary schools.

"Option 1" and "Option 4" were not selected by the District because the District indicated that these options do not address the space requirements necessary to meet the needs of the District's educational program. The District also noted that there is no temporary swing space available within the District, and these options would require the use of temporary modular classrooms, which are expected to cause significant disruption to ongoing education during construction. Moreover, the use of temporary modular classrooms would result in additional project costs.

"Option 2" and "Option 5" were not selected by the District because the District indicated there is no temporary swing space available within the District, and these options require the use of temporary modular classrooms, which are anticipated to result in significant disruption to ongoing education during construction. Additionally, the use of temporary modular classrooms would result in additional project costs.

"Option 3A" and "Option 3C" were not selected by the District due to the proposed location on the eastern part of the Fox Hill Site, which does not provide optimal solar orientation for classrooms. Moreover, construction phasing and site work have a larger potential impact to project costs and site traffic.

^{**} Does not include construction contingency

^{***}District's Preferred Schematic

"Option 3B" was not selected by the District because the proposed 3-story building option does not provide the desired adjacencies and programmatic relationships when compared to the Preferred Schematic option.

"Option 6A" and "Option 6B" were not selected by the District because the larger enrollment of 640 students would increase traffic in the residential neighborhoods adjacent to the Fox Hill Site and does not align with the community's desire to maintain four neighborhood elementary schools.

"Option 7" was not selected by the District because the District indicated concerns associated with expanding the student population on the smaller Pine Glen site, anticipated construction costs, and a longer construction duration.

"Option 8" was not selected by the District because the District indicated concerns associated with the smaller size of the Pine Glen site, impact to ongoing education during construction, anticipated challenges associated with traffic, and limited space for outdoor learning and play areas.

As noted above, "Option 9" was included for cost comparison purposes only.

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee ("FAS") on January 17, 2024. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed the following items: appreciation for the District's Educational Program, including the incorporation of professional development, participation in the LABBB Collaborative, use of tutors and integration of reading with math and science curricula; distribution of Special Education spaces and DESE submittal process; proposed location of handicap parking and sheltered access to the building for individuals with limited mobility at the main entrance, gymnasium and bus drop-off area; plans for phased construction on site while the existing facility remains in use; location of proposed outdoor play areas and access to the building for emergency vehicles; suggestion for considering buffer zones between neighborhood schools; potential opportunities to introduce world language program at elementary level; the view of the building from the street and upon approach; orientation of the gymnasium; appreciation of the simple and efficient building layout; and, opportunities to utilize wetlands and vernal pool for outdoor learning and further develop indoor/outdoor connections as the design progresses.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's Preferred Schematic is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) Prior to the submission of the District's Schematic Design submittal, the MSBA requests that the District be available to present updates to the preferred solution to the FAS should the MSBA determine an updated presentation is required. This update is to ensure a mutual understanding and agreement of the proposed project scope and to ensure that this scope will be reflected in the District's Schematic Design submittal.
- 3) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.

- 4) The District's Special Education submission will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to better understand the total area associated with health and physical education and how the space serves the student population and the renovation of the existing facility.
- 7) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Burlington be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Fox Hill Elementary School with a new facility serving kindergarten through grade 5 on the existing site.