

District: City of Boston
 School Name: Josiah Quincy Upper School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: September 25, 2013

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to accept the City of Boston’s preferred solution, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to replace the existing Josiah Quincy Upper School and the Boston Arts Academy with a new facility located on a new site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the City’s preferred solution to co-locate the Josiah Quincy Upper School and the Boston Arts Academy in a newly constructed facility serving grades 6-12 on a new site. Staff also recommends that the City be approved to proceed into schematic design after and contingent upon the MSBA’s receipt of a Preferred Solution Supplemental from the City by October 24, 2013 and the establishment of a mutually agreeable total building gross floor area by November 1, 2013.

District Information	
District Name	City of Boston
Early Childhood Center(s)	1 (PK) 4 (PK-1) 1 (PK-2) 2 (K-3)
K-12 Facility(s)	1 (PK-12) 1 (1-12)
Elementary School(s)	40 (PK-5) 5 (K-5) 1 (PK-6) 1 (2-6) 19 (PK-8) 2 (K-8)
Middle School(s)	1 (3-8) 1 (4-8) 8 (6-8) 1 (6-9)
Middle/High School(s)	3 (6-12) 3 (7-12)
High School(s)	22 (9-12)
Priority School Name	Josiah Quincy Upper School
Type of School	Middle-High School
Grades Served	6-12
Year Opened	Josiah Quincy Upper School (housed in three buildings): 1911: former Abraham Lincoln School 1920: small office building located at 16-29 Church Street adjacent to former Abraham Lincoln School 2000: temporary modular classroom building located 2 blocks from the former Abraham Lincoln School at 900 Washington Street

District Information	
	Boston Arts Academy: 1920's: originally used as a Post Office warehouse
Existing Square Footage	Josiah Quincy Upper School: 72,444: former Abraham Lincoln School 17,600: adjacent office building 17,000: temporary modular classroom building 133,000: Boston Arts Academy building, inclusive of the space to be vacated by the Fenway High School
Additions	Josiah Quincy Upper School (three buildings): None Boston Arts Academy: No building additions, however, pending relocation of Fenway High School, additional space would be made available to the Boston Arts Academy
Acreage of Site	Adjacent Arlington and Church Street Parcels: 1.0 acre Washington Street Parcel (temporary modular units): 1.9 acres
Building Issues	<p>The District identified deficiencies with the Josiah Quincy Upper School in the following areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mechanical systems - Electrical systems - Plumbing systems - Accessibility <p>In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program and that students are spread over three facilities, and require use of a local YMCA for delivery of their physical education curriculum.</p> <p>The District identified deficiencies with the Boston Arts Academy in the following areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Electrical systems - Windows and Façade - Roof <p>In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not provide the types of spaces required to deliver its arts-based educational program and has reported overcrowding.</p>
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2012-2013 Enrollment	Josiah Quincy Upper School – 513 (grades 6-12) Boston Arts Academy – 420 (grades 9-12)
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Josiah Quincy Upper School – 650 (grades 6-12) Boston Arts Academy – 710 (grades 6-12)
Enrollment Specifics	The City and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 650 students in grades 6-12 for the Josiah Quincy Upper School, and 710 students in grades 6-12 for the Boston Arts Academy.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	November 18, 2009
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On October 2, 2013 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on July 30, 2014
Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives	74.06%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager	Maureen Anderson, City Employee, City of Boston
Designer	HMFH Architects, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Josiah Quincy Upper School (“JQUS”) occupies three buildings: the former Abraham Lincoln School, a four-story structure with an area of about 72,444 square feet (“sf”), the Church Street building, a three-story office building (17,600 sf) on an adjacent site between Arlington Street and Church Street that totals about one acre, and temporary modular classroom units (~17,000 sf) located on a 1.9 acre site at the intersection of Washington Street and Marginal Road. The three facilities house students in grades 6-12.

The former Lincoln School building was constructed in 1911 and received a minor electrical system upgrade in 1983, new windows in 1996, technology improvements in 1999, new boilers and control system upgrade in 2000, and a new roof in 2008. The adjacent office building was built in 1920 and renovated in 2006. The temporary modular classrooms located on Washington Street were built in 2000¹. The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest it submitted for JQUS noting issues with the mechanical systems and the facilities’ lack of adequate spaces, including science classrooms/labs, cafeteria, library/media center, gymnasium, and auditorium. The City reported that using three separate facilities plus an off-site YMCA for physical education is inhibiting delivery of the educational curriculum.

The Boston Arts Academy (“BAA”), which opened in 1998, currently shares a facility with Fenway High School. The 133,000 sf building was constructed in the 1920’s to serve as a postal facility and received a major renovation in 1998, including new mechanical and electrical systems, new interior walls, and a new roof in preparation for use by the BAA. Windows were replaced and masonry repairs performed in 2006 and a new heating and ventilating unit was installed in 2007¹. The District identified a number of deficiencies in this facility, including electrical and technology systems, as well as issues with flooding of the lobby, leaking windows in the cafeteria and some of the classrooms. The District also identifies a number of limitations of the facility that constrain delivery of its curriculum and course offerings.

The City has previously performed a Program and Site Selection Study with the BAA to develop future programming for the existing high school and a new middle school for the arts and to investigate potential sites. The 2010 report examined 12 potential sites and identified a number of deficiencies associated with the existing BAA facility including: a lack of appropriate performance and practice spaces; an insufficient number of practice rooms and classrooms for the music

¹ No records have been located to indicate that the Commonwealth has provided grant funding for any of these improvements.

department; inadequate storage; and a lack of appropriate spaces for visual arts studios and facilities.

As part of this Feasibility Study, the City and its consultants performed an evaluation of major building systems for each of the three buildings associated with the JQUS. The Lincoln School facility’s lighting and fire alarm systems do not meet current standards. There are also issues with heating and cooling throughout the building and there are a number of issues regarding accessibility. The adjacent office building’s systems are in fair condition but the majority of the systems in these two buildings are near the end of their useful life and would need to be replaced. These two facilities are located within the Bay Village Historic District which would require that all options, with the exception of a “No Build” option, would require full approval of the Boston Landmark Commission.

The modular classroom units were originally intended to provide space for a couple of years to accommodate a temporary expansion of the JQUS. The modular classroom units are located on property that is subject to a land swap agreement. As it will not be available long-term, an existing conditions review of this facility was not performed.

In conjunction with its consultants, the City performed a comprehensive assessment of its educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. A significant goal of the proposed project is to house all of the students in the JQUS into a single facility that contains all the spaces needed for delivery of the curriculum. Because of the insufficient size and layout of the existing Lincoln School and Church Street building, significant reconfiguration and expansion would be required to meet the educational needs.

Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied nine preliminary options that included four addition/renovation configurations and five new construction options. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives considered:

Option	Description of Preliminary Options	Construction Cost
0	Base repair code compliance	\$34.0 M
1	Renovation/addition of Arlington St building with underground gym	\$62.3 M
1A	Renovation/addition of Arlington St building with no gym	\$54.9 M
2	New construction on Arlington St Site	\$55.8 M
2A	New construction on Arlington St Site behind existing façade	\$58.6 M
3	New construction above Josiah Quincy Elementary School	\$98.3 M
3A	New construction above a renovated Josiah Quincy Elementary School	\$139.5 M
4	New school on site of temporary modular classrooms	\$55.5 M
5	Renovation/addition to Arlington St building & new construction above Josiah Quincy Elementary School	\$99.5 M
5A	Renovation/addition to Arlington St building & new construction above a renovated Josiah Quincy Elementary School	\$140.7 M

As a result of the MSBA’s review of the options included in the Preliminary Design Program (“PDP”) submittal and the MSBA’s concern regarding the expansion of the project into the

elementary school grades, the City and its consultants developed and analyzed two additional options:

Option	Description of Preliminary Options	Construction Cost
6	Renovation/addition to Arlington St building & new construction on Arlington Street lot	\$61.1 M
7	New construction on Mass Turnpike Air Rights	\$100.9 M

Upon further review and discussion, MSBA staff and the City agreed to four final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation. One of the options included additional site investigations to ensure all possible site options were considered.

During investigation of other potential sites in the area, the City identified five possible sites, and concluded that Parcel 25 (“Option 12A” listed below) is the most advantageous site for the development of a school because of its location, size, relative ease of acquisition, and access to public transportation. Although the proposed site has many benefits, development of this site in order to meet Department of Transportation (“DOT”) requirements will be costly. In an effort to maximize the benefits of this parcel, the City considered the use of the site for the co-location of two schools. Parcel 25 is located adjacent to the Theater District and public transportation, making this site well suited for the Josiah Quincy Upper School and the Boston Arts Academy. The City included five options in its final evaluation as described below:

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction (cost*/sf)**	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 3A: JQUS at JQ Elementary School Site	419,000	212,000 \$281.63/sf	207,000 \$524.80/sf	\$1,755,000	\$168,351,662 \$401.79/sf	\$237,179,601
Option 7: New School on Turnpike Air Rights	177,184	0 N/A	177,184 \$654.98/sf	\$0	\$116,052,564 \$654.98/sf	\$168,176,587
Option 8A: New construction Behind Existing Lincoln School Façade	152,672	0 N/A	152,672 \$482.32/sf	\$680,000	\$73,636,000 \$482.32/sf	\$109,520,976
Option 12A: New JQUS on Parcel 25	184,155	0 NA	184,155 \$643.21/sf	\$150,000	\$118,451,011 \$643.21/sf	\$166,255,396

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Constructi on (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction (cost*/sf)**	Estimated Total Project Costs
<i>Option 12B: New Co- Located JQUS & BAA on Parcel 25</i>	<i>319,525</i>	<i>0</i>	<i>319,525</i>	<i>\$150,000</i>	<i>\$186,164,674</i>	<i>\$261,643,227</i>
		<i>N/A</i>	<i>\$582.16/sf</i>		<i>\$582.16/sf</i>	

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

******District's preferred option***

The City has selected “Option 12 B – New Co-Located JQUS & BAA on Parcel 25,” as the preferred solution to proceed into schematic design. The District selected this option as its preferred alternative because of the benefits to two of the City’s schools, the central location near both Chinatown and the Theater District, accessibility to public transit, shared infrastructure costs associated with the site and building, and the opportunity for savings associated with shared spaces.

The City presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on September 11, 2013. At that meeting, members of the FAS noted previous discussion regarding the Josiah Quincy Upper School and inquired about the following regarding the Boston Arts Academy: 1) proposed enrollment for the Boston Arts Academy; 2) the proposed grade configuration and impact on access for students across the City; 3) consideration of pairing non-traditional studies; 4) commitment to working with other middle schools on an arts curriculum; and 5) options for students who do not continue into the Boston Arts Academy after 8th grade. The FAS and MSBA staff also inquired about the following: 1) flexible design of the visual art and science spaces; 2) design considerations for the delivery, storage, handling, and disposal of chemicals associated with the science and arts curriculum; 3) site acquisition and schedule, and 4) mechanical system options and locations.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and has reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 650 students for the JQUS School in grades 6-12, and 710 students for the BAA in grades 6-12.
- 2) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 3) The District will submit an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget for MSBA review.

- 4) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval, and continued review by the City for additional efficiencies that may be available in their preferred solution, the final building area and conceptual layouts will be reviewed and submitted to the MSBA by October 24, 2013 and a mutually agreeable solution established by November 1, 2013. Based on this forthcoming effort, the MSBA may participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to better understand the total areas associated with the BAA.
- 7) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Boston be approved to proceed into schematic design for the replacement of the existing Josiah Quincy Upper School and the Boston Arts Academy with a new facility located on a new site contingent upon MSBA receipt of a Preferred Solution Supplemental from the City by October 24, 2013 and establishment of a mutually agreeable total building gross floor area by November 1, 2013.