

District: Town of Holbrook
 School Name: Holbrook Junior/Senior High School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: March 19, 2014

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Holbrook (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Holbrook Junior/Senior High, South Elementary and John F. Kennedy Schools with a new K-12 facility on the existing site of the Holbrook Junior/Senior High School. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution to replace the existing Holbrook Junior/Senior High, South Elementary and John F. Kennedy Schools with a new K-12 facility on the existing site of the Holbrook Junior/Senior High School.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Holbrook
Elementary School(s)	John F. Kennedy School (PK-3) South Elementary School (4-6)
Middle School(s)	N/A
High/High School(s)	Holbrook Junior/Senior High School (7-12)
Priority School Name	Holbrook Junior/Senior High School
Type of School	Junior/Senior High School
Grades Served	7-12
Year Opened	1956
Existing Square Footage	96,440
Additions	N/A
Acreage of Site	36.67 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Structural integrity – Mechanical systems – Electrical systems – Plumbing systems – Envelope – Windows – Roof – Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2013-2014 Enrollment	480 (7-12)
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 880 (K-8) 490 (6-12) 390 (7-12) 1,095 (K-12) (Preferred Solution)

District Information	
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 1,095 students in grades K-12, that will serve grades PK-12.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	November 28, 2007
Invitation to Eligibility Period	January 25, 2012
Invitation to Feasibility Study	October 3, 2012
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On March 26, 2014 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on July 30, 2014
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	60.57%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager	Symmes Maini & McKee Associates
Designer	Flansburgh Architects

Discussion

As part of the Feasibility Study, the MSBA agreed with the District’s request to explore options that included various consolidation options of the District’s grade K-12 student population resulting in four study design enrollments: 880 students for grades K-8 (high school students would attend a school outside of District), 490 students for grades 6-12 (to relieve overcrowding at elementary schools), 390 students for grades 7-12 (current configuration), and 1,095 students for grades K-12 (consolidation of student population in 1 facility). The study performed by the District and its consultants included the evaluation of the District’s three existing schools: the Holbrook Junior/Senior High School, South Elementary School, and the John F. Kennedy Elementary School.

The existing Junior/Senior High School is a 95,420 square foot two-story facility located on a 36 acre site in the center of Holbrook. The original school building was constructed in 1956. All of the infrastructure components are original equipment with the exception of the boilers, which were replaced in 1995, and, within the past 15 years, the District replaced the roof and performed upgrades to the science laboratories without the financial assistance of the Commonwealth. The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest (“SOI”) including, deteriorating windows, antiquated electrical, HVAC, plumbing and life safety systems, non-compliant accessibility, and interior spaces insufficiently sized to accommodate the delivery of the District’s educational program.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions of the Holbrook Junior/Senior High School, the District’s two elementary schools, and the educational program for the District, and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. The assessment of the Junior/Senior High School confirmed the deficiencies stated in the SOI and determined that the requirements to meet current codes will impact all spaces and effectively require a full renovation of the school to achieve compliance.

The existing South Elementary School is a 37,500 square foot single-story facility located on a 13.5 acre site on the southern edge of Holbrook. The existing South Elementary School facility currently houses grades 4-6. The original school building opened in 1959. The District identified numerous deficiencies in the existing conditions study. The existing HVAC, plumbing, fire protection and electrical systems are mostly original, inefficient, and are in need of replacement. Exterior walls are non-insulated and showing signs of water infiltration. Windows and doors are mostly original. The roof was replaced 20 years ago and is out of warranty. The requirements to meet current codes will impact all spaces and effectively require a full renovation of the school to achieve compliance.

The existing John F. Kennedy Elementary School is a 40,000 square foot single-story facility located on a 12 acre site adjacent to the Holbrook Junior/Senior High School Site. The existing John F. Kennedy Elementary School facility currently houses grades PK-3. The original school building opened in 1964. The District identified numerous deficiencies in the existing conditions study. The existing HVAC, plumbing, fire protection and electrical systems are mostly original, inefficient, and are in need of replacement. Exterior walls are non-insulated and steel lintels above the windows are deteriorating, and many need to be replaced. Interior finishes are worn and need to be replaced. The requirements to meet current codes will impact all spaces and effectively require a full renovation of the school to achieve compliance.

Based on the findings of these comprehensive assessments, the District and its consultants initially studied nine preliminary options based on four study enrollments, which included five addition/renovation configurations and four new construction options as described below.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
1A	New Construction – Grades 6-12 (490 students)
1B	Addition/ renovation of existing facility – Grades 6-12 (490 students)
2A	New Construction – Grades 7-12 (390 students)
2B	Addition/ renovation of existing facility – Grades 7-12 (390 students)
3A	New Construction – Grades PK-12 (1,095 students)
3B	Addition/ renovation of existing facility – Grades PK-12 (1,095 students)
4A	New Construction – Grades PK-8 (880 students)
4B	Addition/ renovation of existing facility – Grades PK-8 (880 students)
5	Base repair ‘No-build’

The District concluded that all of the addition/renovation options were not desirable primarily due to the longer construction durations, disruptions to students, and costs that were almost equal to or sometimes greater than the cost of a new school, and therefore recommended only new construction options for further consideration. Additionally, the District determined that the grade

7-12 options would not alleviate overcrowding at the District’s elementary schools, and therefore was not a viable option. After further discussion with the MSBA regarding the importance of considering all feasibility options, the District carried a repair option and an addition and renovation option in the final evaluation of options.

Upon further review and discussion, MSBA staff and the District agreed to five final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 1A: (New Construction Grades 6-12)	127,497	n/a	127,497 \$339/sf	\$9,236,309	\$52,441,721 \$411/sf	\$66,963,129
Option 3A: *** (New Construction Grades PK-12)	217,353	n/a	217,353 \$318/sf	\$9,711,126	\$78,842,409 \$362/sf	\$101,134,951
Option 3B: (Add/Reno Grades 6-12)	217,353	96,440 \$305/sf	120,913 \$347/sf	\$8,866,049	\$80,282,480 \$369/sf	\$104,956,898
Option 4A: (New Construction Grades PK-8)	141,068	n/a	141,068 \$350/sf	\$8,592,059	\$57,958,271 \$411/sf	\$74,470,406
Option 5: (Base repair)	96,440	96,440 \$284/sf	n/a	\$2,575,253	\$29,922,712 \$310/sf	\$37,403,390

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

***District’s preferred option – This option includes estimated gross square footage that is beyond that included in the MSBA guidelines. Staff will work with the District early in the schematic design process to refine and finalize gross square footage.

The District has selected Option 3A: New Construction Grades PK-12, as the preferred solution to proceed into schematic design. The District selected Option 3A as its preferred solution because it addresses all the facility related deficiencies throughout the District, and helps support the District’s desired educational program at a lower estimated cost than Options 3B. The District has indicated that, as the design provides two schools within a single building, one PK-5 and one 6-12, and that it provides appropriate separation for grade cohorts. The proposed K-12 facility will enhance student transitions, provide a continuum of curriculum and instruction, and will promote operational efficiencies by providing services in a single building. The District has stated that the preferred solution increases educational opportunities for students, allows for shared resources, and reduces operating costs, as well as providing for the future possibility of regionalization with

the Town of Avon. The preferred option includes district offices which will be deemed ineligible for MSBA funding.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on February 26, 2014. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised a number of concerns regarding the resources and transitioning of 5th grade teachers impacted by the grade reconfiguration, the potential flexibility of technology spaces, the potential for incorporating break-out areas within the building, additional green space at the elementary school entrance, and how, with minimal adjustments, the proposed building could be adapted to accommodate a regionalized high school population.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) MSBA previously completed a study enrollment projection and reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 880 students for a K-8 facility, 390 students for a grade 7-12 facility, 490 students for a grade 6-12 facility, or 1,095 students for a K-12 facility. Based on the District’s preferred solution, the District will be required to execute a final Design Enrollment Certification indicating acceptance of a 1,095-student enrollment serving grades K-12. A Design Enrollment Certification will be provided by the MSBA for District signature.
- 2) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and that the District’s preferred solution is reasonable and cost effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 3) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 4) The District’s schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the schematic design phase. The MSBA will work with the District and its consultants early in the schematic design phase to understand the need and determine eligibility for the additional spaces associated with the proposed Junior/Senior High School Cafeteria and the stage included in the elementary school cafeteria (second stage area included in the proposed facility).
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Holbrook be approved to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Holbrook Junior/Senior High, South Elementary and John F. Kennedy Schools with a new K-12 facility on the existing site of the Holbrook Junior/Senior High School.