

District: Town of Wakefield
 School Name: Galvin Middle School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: November 9, 2011

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Wakefield, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Galvin Middle School on the existing site. MSBA staff reviewed the Feasibility Study and conditionally accepts the District’s preferred solution to replace the existing Galvin Middle School with the construction of a new Galvin Middle School on the existing site.

District Information	
District Name	Wakefield
Elementary School(s)	Dolbeare Elementary School (PK-4) Woodville Elementary School (PK-4) Greenwood Elementary School (K-4) Walton Elementary School (K-4)
Middle School	Galvin Middle School (5-8)
High School	Wakefield Memorial High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Galvin Middle School
Type of School	Middle School
Grades Served	5-8
Year Opened	1954
Total Square Footage	166,880
Additions	New 16 classroom addition in 1974
Acreage of Site	15.16 acres
Building Issues	The District noted deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Envelope - Mechanical systems - Electrical systems - Accessibility <p>In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported overcrowding and the existing classroom spaces and layout inhibit delivery of its desired educational program.</p>
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2010-2011 Enrollment	1,091
Agreed Upon Enrollment	1,070
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 1,070 students serving grades 5-8.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	July 28, 2010
Preferred Schematic	November 16, 2011

MSBA Board Votes	
Authorization	
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization in March, 2012
Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives	48.47%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager	Joslin Lesser & Associates, Inc.
Designer	Tappe Associates, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Galvin Middle School, the District's prioritized Statement of Interest, was built in 1954 as Wakefield Memorial High School and repurposed in 1974 into a Junior High School. The existing 166,880 square foot, two-story "U" shaped building includes a linear classroom and cafeteria wing, an administration and auditorium wing, and a gymnasium and building trades wing that surrounds a central courtyard. Although the building is reported to be structurally sound, the work that would be required to create an accessible, energy efficient facility that conforms to current code requirements is significant in part because the relatively shallow vertical floor to floor dimensions inhibit cost effective renovation and system replacement options.

The District considered student assignments within the District, potential opportunities for tuition agreements with adjacent districts, the use of existing educational space through leasing or acquisition, and the use of existing town-owned facilities, and determined that none of these options is viable. In conjunction with the design team, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program of Galvin Middle School, receiving input from educators, administrators, community members, and facilities personnel.

Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its design team initially considered six options, which were then narrowed down to three options for additional investigation and submittal to the MSBA, including two addition and renovation options and one new construction option.

- Option 1 – An extensive renovation and addition option: brings the building up to current code compliance, addresses programming and building deficiencies through extensive renovations and multiple small additions
- Option 2 – A limited renovation and addition option: includes renovation of existing gymnasium and auditorium and construction of some new core facilities and a three-story classroom wing
- Option 3 – A new school option including an auditorium on the western corner of the site

Wakefield town officials, committee members, and members of the public considered the preservation of the existing auditorium, described as the only large venue in the community, as a critical component in their preliminary evaluation of alternatives, and therefore they included the

auditorium in all preliminary options even though the MSBA guidelines do not include an auditorium for middle schools. The District initially selected Option 2 as the preferred solution because they believed it best addressed critical criteria, including continued use of the existing auditorium (a space not included in the MSBA guidelines), cost, traffic, and student safety, and minimized student disruption during construction.

On November 2, 2011, the District presented these three options to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”). At that meeting, members of the Subcommittee raised a number of concerns regarding the District’s preferred solution, including the relative benefits and risk associated with preserving not only the existing auditorium, but the existing gymnasium; the negative impact of preserving the auditorium and gymnasium spaces on both the analysis and the selection of the District’s preferred solution; the educational adjacencies and building efficiency associated with the proposed layout; and, the proposed spaces beyond what is included in the MSBA guidelines that increased the costs included in Option 3.

After the District submitted its Preferred Schematic Report and in response to the discussions during the November 2, 2011 FAS meeting, the District developed two additional alternatives, Option “2R-Add/reno” and Option “2R-New”. Based upon the estimated costs and evaluation summarized in Table 1, the District and its Designer determined that the most cost effective solution that best meets the District’s educational needs and priorities is Option 2R-New.

Table 1 – Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing						
Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction* (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 1 Addition/Renovation	203,241	160,670 sf \$206/sf	42,571 \$288/sf	\$10,685,696	\$56,035,578 \$276/sf	\$70,156,543
Option 2 Auditorium/Gym Reno + Addition	198,563	47,128 sf \$228/sf	151,435 \$241/sf	\$8,782,988	\$56,081,042 \$282/sf	\$68,811,439
Option 3 New Construction	198,865	n/a	198,865 \$264/sf	\$9,146,880	\$61,605,077 \$310/sf	\$75,589,429
Option 2R- Add/Reno	190,613	26,888 sf \$228/sf	163,725 \$253/sf	\$8,843,000	\$56,408,715 \$296/sf	\$69,213,493
Option 2R- New***	187,732	n/a	187,732 \$259/sf	\$8,900,000	\$57,572,588 \$307/sf	\$70,641,565

* *Marked up construction costs*

** *Does not include construction contingency*

*** *District’s preferred option*

Evaluation of the options listed above indicates that Option 3 (new construction) is the most costly option proposed, due primarily to the inclusion of spaces that are not typical for middle school projects and the less efficient building layout that resulted in a larger facility. Option 3 also is approximately 11,000 gross square feet larger than the updated Option 2R-New, primarily because of additional gym space and a less efficient building layout. Both 2R options resolve space adjacency issues discussed during the November 2, 2011 FAS meeting. The District has indicated that maintaining an auditorium in this project as either new or renovated, even if categorically

ineligible for MSBA reimbursement, and centering the building across the southern portion of the site to address issues identified in their traffic study, are both critical.

The District believes that Option 2R-New best meets the needs of the District's educational program, proposes to produce an energy-efficient facility that addresses the deficiencies identified in the Statement of Interest, minimizes student disruption, and best addresses issues associated with site circulation and local traffic patterns in a cost-effective manner.

The MSBA staff accepts the conclusion of the Designer's Feasibility Study and subsequent submissions that identify the options that have been explored on behalf of the District and that the preferred solution selected by the District is reasonable and cost effective. However, MSBA staff have yet to complete their review of the space summary associated with Option 2R-New, which was received on November 8, 2011.

MSBA staff have reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed, including an executed Initial Compliance Certification, the composition of the School Building Committee, and the enrollment information.
- 2) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and has reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 1,070 students for the Galvin Middle School.
- 3) MSBA reviewed the original Feasibility Study submittal and found that the three options investigated were not sufficiently comprehensive in scope. MSBA's review of the revised options proposed by the District after the November 2, 2011 FAS meeting found that, with the additional submittal, the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in their scope and the District's preferred solution is reasonable and appears to meet the needs identified by the District.
- 4) An operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget have been submitted to the MSBA for review.
- 5) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education prior to a project scope and budget agreement.
- 6) The MSBA will allow the proposed project to include an auditorium and associated spaces to replace the existing auditorium and associated spaces. However, the total proposed net square foot area associated with the auditorium shall not exceed the net area of the current auditorium spaces.
- 7) The MSBA will not participate in any additional costs associated with the design, demolition, construction, or replacement of the existing auditorium, which will be the full responsibility of the District and shall not be eligible for reimbursement.
- 8) As part of the schematic design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

- 9) MSBA staff will continue to work with the District regarding Option 2R-New, which was received on November 8, 2011, to better understand how the space summary, building layout, and floor plans support the District's educational program during the early phase of schematic design to reach an agreed upon final square footage for the proposed project by December 1, 2011.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Wakefield be conditionally approved to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Galvin Middle School with the construction of a new Galvin Middle School on the existing site.