

District: City of Haverhill
 School Name: Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: January 22, 2014

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Haverhill as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School on the existing site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution to replace the existing 6-8 Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School with a new co-located K-4 lower school and 5-8 upper school facility on the existing site.

District Information	
District Name	City of Haverhill
Elementary School(s)	Bartlett Kindergarten Center (K) Bradford Elementary School (1-4) Crowell (K) Golden Hill Elementary School (K-4) Greenleaf Elementary School (K-2) Moody (K) Pentucket Lake Elementary School (K-4) Tilton Elementary School (K-4) Walnut Square Elementary School (K-2)
Middle School(s)	Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School (6-8) Consentino Middle School (K-8) Dr. Paul Nettle Middle School (5-8) John G. Whittier Middle School (5-8)
High School(s)	Haverhill High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School
Type of School	Middle School
Grades Served	6-8
Year Opened	1959
Existing Square Footage	59,555
Additions	N/A
Acreage of Site	17 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Structural integrity – Mechanical systems – Electrical systems – Plumbing systems – Envelope – Windows – Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown

District Information	
2012-2013 Enrollment	416
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 455 (6-8), 1,005 (K-8)(Preferred Solution), 805 (4-8), 920 (1-8)
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board's approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 1,005 students in grades K-8.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	October 3, 2012
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On January 29, 2014 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on June 4, 2014
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	67.66%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager	Joslin Lesser + Associates, Inc.
Designer	JCJ Architecture

Discussion

The existing Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School is a 59,555 square foot ("SF") facility on a 17 acre site located at 98 Winchester Street in Haverhill, Massachusetts. The facility currently houses 416 students in grades 6-8.

The original school building was constructed in 1959 and has not been renovated or expanded except for a 1999 roof replacement and two boilers that were replaced in 2005. The first floor structural slab is severely deteriorated resulting in the north classroom wing being evacuated in 2011 and 2012 while shoring was installed as a temporary repair. The design of the roof structure no longer meets the building code and the school is not accessible to the handicapped. The building is too small for its current or projected enrollment and (with the exception of the boilers) the mechanical, electrical and plumbing systems are failing.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Multiple cracks were observed in the interior masonry partition walls, the exterior masonry façade, and in the exposed concrete foundation walls. The District reported that the structure of the existing building is inadequate and the existing roof framing cannot support snow loads per the design loads for new structures.

In order to ensure that the feasibility study was sufficiently broad in scope to address existing issues regarding overcrowding, outdated structures and existing undesirable grade configurations

within the District, MSBA agreed to include four design enrollments and grade configurations. The design team investigated the viability of seven potential school sites, and determined that the existing site is preferred over the others. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants reduced their preliminary investigations to 8 options that included a new construction option and an addition/renovation option for each of the 4 grade configurations studied, all on the existing Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School site. A base repair option was not analyzed due to the small size of the existing building (30% smaller than MSBA standards for the smallest agreed upon design enrollment), and the structural deficiencies of the existing building. The following options result in revised grade reconfigurations within the District for the existing Greenleaf K-2 and Bradford K-5 facilities as well as the Hunking 6-8 School. The following is a list of the preliminary alternatives considered:

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
2A	Hunking School add/reno; grades K-8, 1,005 students (Greenleaf closed, Bradford remains as K-5)
2B	Hunking School add/reno; grades 1-8, 920 students (Greenleaf reduced to K and Bradford remains as K-5)
2C	Hunking School add/reno; grades 4-8, 805 students (Greenleaf t to remain as K-2 and Bradford reduced to K-3)
2D	Hunking School add/reno; grades 6-8, 455 students (Greenleaf to remain as K-2 and Bradford remains as K-5)
3	Hunking School new construction; grades K-8, 1,005 students (Greenleaf closed, Bradford reduced to K-4)
3B	Hunking School new construction; grades 1-8, 920 students (Greenleaf reduced to K and Bradford remains as K-5)
3C	Hunking School new construction; grades 4-8, 805 students (Greenleaf to remain as K-2 and Bradford reduced to K-3)
3D	Hunking School new construction; grades 6-8, 455 students (Greenleaf to remain as K-2 and Bradford remains as K-5)

After additional analysis of these options by the District and design team, no options were approved by the District for further consideration that included other viable school sites, or grade configurations for the Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School site other than the K-8 1,005 student option. To ensure a comprehensive feasibility study, MSBA asked the District to provide comparative construction and project costs evaluations for the 4-8, 1,005 student and 6-8, 455 student options on the Bradford Elementary School site, as described below:

Option	Description
4 <i>(previously titled option 3)</i>	New construction on the Hunking site; grades K-8, 1,005 students (Greenleaf closed, Bradford reduced to K-4)
5	New construction on the Bradford site; grades 4-8, 1,005 students (Greenleaf closed, Bradford reduced to K-3)
6	New construction on the Bradford site; grades 6-8, 455 students (Greenleaf remains K-2, Bradford remains K-5)

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to four final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below:

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 2A: (Hunking Site, Add/Reno K-8, 1,005 students)	147,992	18,810 \$321/sf	129,182 \$286/sf	\$5,390,000	\$48,374,062 \$327/sf	\$61,960,096 (includes \$2M swing space)
Option 4: (Hunking Site, New K-8, 1,005 students) ***	147,992	- -	147,992 \$309/sf	\$4,306,000	\$50,025,600 \$338/sf	\$61,531,488
Option 5: (Bradford site, New 4-8, 1,005 students)	153,250	- -	153,250 \$305/sf	\$4,850,000	\$51,591,250 \$337/sf	\$64,687,238 (includes \$1M to acquire adjacent property)
Option 6: (Bradford site, New 6-8, 455 students)	84,306	- -	84,306 \$312/sf	\$4,850,000	\$31,153,472 \$370/sf	\$53,078,771 (includes \$11M for Greenleaf Reno and \$1M to acquire adjacent property)

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

***District's preferred option

The District selected Option 4, a new K-8 facility located on the existing Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School site to replace the existing 6-8 Middle School as the preferred solution to proceed into schematic design. The District selected Option 4 as its preferred alternative because it is the most cost-effective option that meets the educational goals of the District, reduces overcrowding at the Bradford Elementary School, replaces the existing structurally unsound 1969 Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School, and removes the existing 1888 Greenleaf School from the District's inventory.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (the "FAS") on October 23, 2013. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised issues regarding the proposed solution and how the proposed grade configuration aligns with other schools in the District, the District's educational program and the difficulty of determining if the proposed solution aligns with the educational program, and proposed teacher planning space. The FAS requested that the District further develop its educational program and resubmit it to the MSBA.

The District presented its proposed project at a second FAS meeting on January 15, 2014. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised issues regarding the proposed City-wide STEM Academy to be located at the Hunking School and its potential impact on the delivery of science curriculum at the remaining middle schools in the District, and the District's planned transitioning of existing

fifth grade elementary school teachers to a middle school team-teaching environment. The FAS requested that the District receive confirmation from the Office for Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics at the Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education that the educational plan, as it relates to the proposed STEM program, is consistent with state policy, and that the District submit information to demonstrate current training and professional development opportunities, as well as its intent to provide professional development to applicable existing teaching staff for transition into a team-teaching environment.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and has reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 1,005 students for grades K-8 in the Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School. MSBA previously completed a study enrollment projection and reached a mutual agreement with the District for a study enrollment of 455 students for a 6-8 facility, 805 students for a 4-8 facility, 920 students for a 1-8 facility, or 1,005 students for a consolidated K-8 facility. Based on the District's preferred solution, the District will be required to execute a final Design Enrollment Certification indicating acceptance of a 1,005 student enrollment serving grades K-8. A Design Enrollment Certification will be provided by the MSBA for District signature.
- 2) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable and cost effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 3) The District will submit an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget for MSBA review.
- 4) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the schematic design phase.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Haverhill be approved to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing 6-8 Caleb Dustin Hunking Middle School with a new co-located K-4 lower school and 5-8 upper school facility on the existing site.