

District: Town of Swampscott  
 School Name: Hadley Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: December 9, 2020

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Swampscott (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Hadley Elementary School, Clarke Elementary School, and Stanley Elementary School with a new district-wide grades K-4 facility on the site of the existing Stanley Elementary School. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s Preferred Schematic.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	Town of Swampscott
Elementary School(s)	Hadley Elementary School (K-4) Clarke Elementary School (K-4) Stanley Elementary School (K-4)
Middle School(s)	Swampscott Middle School (PK, 5-8)
High School(s)	Swampscott High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Hadley Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	K-4
Year Opened	1911
Existing Square Footage	46,000
Additions	1925 – three story annex added to building
Acreage of Site	1.4 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Structural integrity</li> <li>– Mechanical systems</li> <li>– Electrical systems</li> <li>– Plumbing systems</li> <li>– Envelope</li> <li>– Windows</li> <li>– Accessibility</li> </ul>
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2019-2020 Enrollment	324
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 900 Students (District Wide K-4) (Preferred Schematic) 390 Students (Hadley Students K-4) 565 Students (Hadley K-5) 540 Students (District Wide 3-5)
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the Preferred Schematic, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 900 students serving grade K-4 district-wide.
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	December 13, 2017
Invitation to Feasibility Study	February 13, 2019
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On December 16, 2020 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on June 23, 2021
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	44.68%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	Hill International, Inc.
Designer	LaVallee Brensinger Architects

**Discussion**

The existing Hadley Elementary School is a 46,000 square foot building set on a 1.4- acre site and currently houses grades K-4. The original school building was constructed in 1911, with a three-story annex added in 1925.

The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest (“SOI”) that are associated with structural, mechanical, electrical and plumbing systems, building envelope and windows beyond their usable lifespan, and accessibility constraints.

As part of this Feasibility Study, the MSBA mutually agreed with the District to explore the following four enrollment options: 390 students in grades K-4 (existing configuration), 900 students in grades K-4 (district-wide), 565 students in grades K-5, and 540 students in grades 3-5 (district-wide).

The District was previously invited by the MSBA to conduct a Feasibility Study for the Hadley Elementary School in November of 2012. As a result of that Feasibility Study and Schematic Design, the MSBA Board voted in July of 2014 to approve the District’s proposed project scope to consolidate the existing Hadley Elementary School, Clarke Elementary School, and Stanley Elementary School into a new elementary school serving grades 1-4, adjacent to the existing Swampscott Middle School. The District was unable to secure local authorization and approval of the proposed project scope and budget.

The existing Clarke Elementary School is a 28,000 square foot building which serves grades K-4. The Clarke School building was constructed in 1952. The District’s previously completed feasibility study included an evaluation of the building and found it to be in fair condition and undersized for its population.

The existing Stanley Elementary School is a 40,000 square foot building which serves grades K-4. The original Stanley School building was constructed in 1929, and a three-story addition was completed in 1952. The District’s previously completed feasibility study included an evaluation of the building that found that the building’s age and orientation render it functionally obsolete from an educational perspective.

Working with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied seven (7) preliminary options that included one (1) code upgrade option, one (1) addition/renovation configuration and five (5) new construction options. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary options considered.

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
Code Upgrade	Code Upgrade for 324 students in grades K-4 (Hadley School site)
Alternative 1	Renovation/Addition for 390 students in grades K-4 (Hadley School site)
Alternative 2	New Construction for 390 students in grades K-4 (Hadley School site)
Alternative 3	New Construction for 540 students in grades 3-5 (Hadley School site)
Alternative 4	New Construction for 540 students in grades 3-5 (Middle School site)
Alternative 7A	New Construction for 900 students in grades K-4 (Stanley School site)
Alternative 7B	New Construction for 900 students in grades K-4 (Stanley School site)

Subsequent to the evaluation of the preliminary options, the District developed two additional new construction options on the Stanley School site. Referred to as “Alternative 7C” and “Alternative 7D,” these options were designed in response to community feedback about the building size and scale of “Alternative 7A” and “Alternative 7B.” Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to include these two additional options in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below.

**Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options**

<b>Option (Description)</b>	<b>Total Gross Square Feet</b>	<b>Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)</b>	<b>Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)</b>	<b>Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*</b>	<b>Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)</b>	<b>Estimated Total Project Costs</b>
Code Upgrade	46,000	46,000 \$297/sf	n/a	\$3,560,426	\$17,226,106 \$374/sf	\$22,021,705
Alternative 1: (Reno/Addition for grades K-4 at Hadley)	79,742	34,685 \$622/sf	45,057 \$570/sf	\$7,295,797	\$54,586,478 \$684/sf	\$70,223,640
Alternative 2: (New Const. for grades K-4 at Hadley)	75,135	n/a	75,135 \$570/sf	\$7,806,625	50,654,613 \$674/sf	\$65,851,101
Alternative 3: (New Const. for grades 3-5 at Hadley)	92,204	n/a	92,204 \$524/sf	\$7,871,577	\$56,206,758 \$609/sf	\$73,068,269
Alternative 4: (New Const. for grades 3-5 at Middle School)	92,204	n/a	92,024 \$531/sf	\$12,781,376	\$61,784,114 \$670/sf	\$77,229,707

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Alternative 7A: (New Const. for grades K-4 at Stanley)	153,855	n/a	153,855 \$463/sf	\$11,076,746	\$82,442,388 \$535/sf	\$107,175,211
Alternative 7B: (New Const. for grades K-4 at Stanley)	153,855	n/a	153,855 \$476/sf	\$11,192,711	\$84,507,696 \$549/sf	\$109,859,950
<b>Alternative 7C: (New Const. for grades K-4 at Stanley)***</b>	<b>153,855</b>	<b>n/a</b>	<b>153,855</b> <b>\$462/sf</b>	<b>\$11,397,886</b>	<b>\$82,551,208</b> <b>\$536/sf</b>	<b>\$107,317,116</b>
Alternative 7D: (New Const. for grades K-4 at Stanley)	153,855	n/a	153,855 \$482/sf	\$11,607,885	\$85,816,767 \$557/sf	\$111,561,020

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\***District's Preferred Schematic**

The District has selected “Alternative 7C” as the Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected “Alternative 7C” as its preferred option because it meets the needs of the District’s Educational Program, is designed to provide small-scale learning communities within a single structure and is sited in a manner that preserves open space for play areas, fields and a potential solar panel array. The siting also maintains distance from neighborhood abutters and meets traffic, queuing, and parking needs. Additionally, the District determined that consolidating its grades K-4 enrollment into a single facility will provide district-wide educational equity.

The “Code Upgrade” option was not selected because the District determined it would not meet the needs of its Educational Program.

“Alternative 1,” “Alternative 2” and “Alternative 3” were not selected because the District determined that the Hadley School site was not large enough to support regulation size athletic fields, or sufficient on-site play space, parking and vehicle queuing areas. While the Hadley School site was determined to have good pedestrian access, the District found its vehicular access limited. Additionally, the site’s location in a dense downtown area was determined to limit space for construction staging and work areas, with no opportunity for phased construction.

“Alternative 4” was not selected because it would result in the loss of existing tennis courts and a little league field located on the existing site, and because the District determined that the combination of grade 3-5 traffic with existing traffic to the Middle School would overtax the capabilities of existing and proposed roads and drives.

While “Alternative 7A,” “Alternative 7B” and “Alternative 7D” offer many of the advantages of the Preferred Schematic, they were not selected because the District determined that their larger

building footprints would offer less space for play areas, fields, the potential solar panel array, and for queueing and parking than would “Alternative 7C.”

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on December 2, 2020. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed appreciation for the project’s proposed site and preliminary layout, the massing and façade design, the District’s sustainability aspirations, the importance of distributing Special Education spaces throughout the building and designing exterior learning and play spaces to be fully accessible, the importance of incorporating technology throughout the entire building, the number of sinks in elementary grade classrooms to support project-based learning, the anticipated architectural and programmatic connections between upper and lower grades, and variations to the MSBA space summary guidelines. Members of the FAS also encouraged the District and its consultants to consider the maintenance requirements of rooftop learning and play spaces, to consider incorporating sustainability goals into the school’s curriculum, and to consider variations to the building’s symmetry in response to the varied user needs and experiences of upper and lower grades. MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s Preferred Schematic is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District will submit an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget for MSBA review.
- 3) The District’s Special Education submission will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Swampscott be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Hadley Elementary School, Clarke Elementary School, and Stanley Elementary School with a new district-wide grades K-4 facility on the site of the existing Stanley Elementary School.