

District: City of Boston
 School Name: Josiah Quincy Upper School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: April 8, 2020

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Boston (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to construct a new Josiah Quincy Upper School on the existing Josiah Quincy Upper School annex site at 900 Washington Street, Boston. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s Preferred Schematic, contingent upon the District gaining full ownership, control, and exclusive use of the proposed site. This Preferred Schematic vote recommendation supersedes the May 25, 2016 Preferred Schematic Board vote for new construction on the McKinley site in the South End in Boston.

District Information	
District Name	City of Boston
Elementary School(s)	7 Schools (Early Learners) 40 Schools (K-5) 33 Schools (K-8)
Middle School(s)	6 School (6-8)
High School(s)	6 Schools (K-12 Special Education) 4 Schools (6-12) 3 Schools (7-12) 20 Schools (9-12) 5 Alternative Schools (9-12)
Priority School Name	Josiah Quincy Upper School
Type of School	Middle-High School
Grades Served	6-12
Year Opened	1911
Existing Square Footage	97,973
Additions	Modular classrooms (2000)
Acreage of Site	1.01 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Mechanical systems – Electrical systems – Plumbing systems – Envelope – Windows – Roof – Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2019-2020 Enrollment	533
Agreed Upon Enrollment	650

District Information	
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 650 students serving grades 6-12.
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	No

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	N/A
Invitation to Feasibility Study	November 19, 2009
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On April 15, 2020 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on October 28, 2020
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	74.06% (note that costs of this third study are ineligible for MSBA reimbursement)

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	Skanska USA Building, Inc
Designer	HMFH Architects, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Josiah Quincy Upper School (“JQUS”) currently occupies three buildings on two sites. The main campus is located at the corner of Arlington Street and Marginal Road and contains two buildings, the Arlington Street “Abraham Lincoln” School, built in 1911, and the Church Street building, built in 1949. The Abraham Lincoln School was first built as an upper elementary school, served as Boston High School until the mid-1990s, and now serves as the primary Josiah Quincy Upper School facility. The second JQUS site is a satellite facility located at the corner of Washington Street and Marginal Road, next to the Josiah Quincy Elementary School. This site contains a two-story modular classroom building used as academic annex for the 9th grade students. The existing facilities currently serve grades 6-12.

The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest. The District noted that the existing facility has inadequate toilets, small classrooms and science labs, no kitchen facilities, no accessibility for the handicapped, non-code compliant emergency egress, and inadequate sound control in the classrooms. In addition, the buildings lack required area to provide support to meet the educational needs of the students as described in the educational program.

The City was first invited by the MSBA to conduct a Feasibility Study for the JQUS, then Quincy Upper High School, in November 2009. As a result of that Feasibility Study, the MSBA Board voted in October 2013 to accept the City's preferred solution to replace the existing JQUS and the Boston Arts Academy (“BAA”) with a new facility located on Parcel 25 in Boston. After consultation with the City, the Board vote was rescinded in November 2014 due to cost refinements showing that, due to the added expenses for site development of this building location, the option was no longer cost-effective. In November 2014, the MSBA Board voted to allow the City to continue collaborating with the MSBA in conducting a second Feasibility Study for the JQUS which would identify alternative sites beyond those identified in the first Feasibility Study. The second Feasibility Study investigated a total of 29 various sites in Boston, focusing on three sites that ultimately resulted in a preferred solution approved by the MSBA Board in May

2016 to construct a new facility on the McKinley School site in Boston’s South End. The City later determined that none of the sites identified were viable. The current April 2020 Board recommendation is based on the Preferred Schematic derived from the third Feasibility Study. The MSBA reimbursed the City for costs associated with the first Feasibility Study only. The costs of the additional Feasibility Studies have been borne by the District.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied six preliminary options that included one code upgrade option, one addition/renovation option, and four new construction options. The following is a list of the preliminary options considered:

Option	Description of Preliminary Options	Construction Cost
1	New construction 7 story, on the existing JQUS annex site (900 Washington St); within existing property lines. (199,122 sf). Recommended for further evaluation.	\$150 m
2	New eight story plus basement building, on the existing JQUS annex site (900 Washington St); within existing property lines. (210,435 sf). Recommended for further evaluation.	\$154 m
3	New five story building, on the existing JQUS annex site (900 Washington St); extends over Marginal Street (191,943 sf). Not recommended due to complex structure, extensive approvals process, and security concerns.	\$151 m
4	Addition/renovation to existing Lincoln School & Church Street buildings: 152 Arlington Street and 16 Church Street (113,390 sf). Recommended for further evaluation for comparison purposes.	\$57 m
5	Code upgrades to the existing Lincoln School & Church Street buildings: 152 Arlington St and 16 Church Street (97,953 sf). Recommended for further evaluation for comparison purposes.	\$44 m
6	New eight story building that preserves the existing façades on the existing Lincoln School & Church Street buildings: 152 Arlington Street and 16 Church Street (152,672 sf). Not recommended due to site constraints, limited building area, inefficient layout, and local landmark design restrictions.	\$85 m

Further evaluation of the three Arlington Street property options (Options 4, 5, and 6) reveal that, due to the oddly shaped, small, historically controlled, urban site, none can accommodate the full JQUS Educational Program. However, Addition/Renovation Option 4 and Repair/Code Upgrade Option 5 are further developed in the Final Evaluation of Options for comparative purposes. The City did not consider further analysis of Option 3 over concerns regarding air rights approvals over Marginal Street and structural concerns with the adjacency to the Massachusetts Turnpike retaining wall. MSBA staff and the District agreed to four final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing:

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 1A***: Development of Option 1 above (6 stories and improved efficiencies)	175,052	N/A	175,052 \$811/sq. ft.	\$4,799,728	\$146,815,915 \$839/sq. ft.	\$193,606,532
Option 2A: Development of Option 2 above (7 stories, no basement, improved efficiencies)	192,673	N/A	192,673 \$778/sq. ft.	\$4,617,022	\$154,466,521 \$802/sq. ft.	\$202,789,268
Option 4: Add/Reno Option, Existing Lincoln School & Church Street buildings	113,371	80,181 \$460/sq. ft.	33,190 \$710/sq. ft.	\$8,773,791	\$69,198,111 \$610/sq. ft.	\$100,021,793
Option 5: Code Upgrade Option, Existing Lincoln School & Church St buildings	97,973	96,573 \$478/sq. ft.	1,400 \$504/sq. ft.	\$7,130,399	\$53,974,659 \$551/sq. ft.	\$81,273,780

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

***District's Preferred Schematic

The District has selected “Option 1A”, a new six-story school at the existing Josiah Quincy Upper School annex site at 900 Washington Street as the Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected Option 1A as its Preferred Schematic because it responded most closely to the vision for the school as articulated in the Educational Program. The educational adjacencies proposed in Option 1A offer more support than in Option 2A for key components of the Educational Program including the following components: a unified 6th through 12th grade school; the International Baccalaureate focus on both independent and collaborative work; and “IB for All”. The evaluations continued to show that Options 4 and 5 could not meet the District’s program due to the small and historically controlled existing site. Also, Option 1A more clearly addresses the challenge of welcoming the public into the school for events while maintaining a secure environment for the students, staff, and faculty.

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on March 25, 2020. At that meeting, members of the FAS expressed the need for continued work with the City to further understand proposed refinements to the floor plan during schematic design; the balance of construction costs, total square footage, utilization, efficiencies and educational program needs; the design enrollment of the building and the total building capacity; the District’s outreach plan and any community concerns; and the importance of how the design will respond to the surrounding neighborhood and adjoining properties. MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's Preferred Schematic is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District's Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Boston be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to construct a new 6-12 school on the existing Josiah Quincy Upper School annex site at 900 Washington Street, Boston, contingent upon the District gaining full ownership, control, and exclusive use of the proposed site. This Preferred Schematic recommendation supersedes the May 25, 2016 Preferred Schematic Board vote for new construction on the McKinley site in the South End in Boston.