

District: Town of Medfield  
 School Name: Dale Street Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: February 4, 2021

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Medfield (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to construct a new elementary school facility for grades 4-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School site to replace the existing Dale Street Elementary School. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s Preferred Schematic.

As requested by the District in its Feasibility Study, staff has performed its review of available model school designs and suggests that the following Model Schools may meet the District’s needs, upon confirmation by the Model School designers:

- Andover, Bancroft Elementary School designed by SMMA;
- Burlington Memorial Elementary School designed by Knight, Bagge & Anderson, Inc. who was purchased by Raymond Design Associated in 2018.
- Lexington, Estabrook Elementary School designed by DiNisco Design;
- New Bedford, Lincoln Elementary School designed by Mount Vernon Group Architects; and
- Norfolk, Freeman-Kennedy Elementary School designed by Flansburgh Architects.

Staff recommends that the Executive Director be authorized to approve the District to: (1) proceed with interviews and an evaluation to determine which of the model school designs listed above or its original Preferred Schematic best meet the District’s educational needs and (2) proceed into Schematic Design with either its original Preferred Schematic or the selected model school design to construct a new elementary school facility for grades 4-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School site.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	Town of Medfield
Elementary School(s)	Memorial Elementary School (PK-1) Ralph Wheelock Elementary School (2-3) Dale Street Elementary School (4-5)
Middle School(s)	Thomas A. Blake Middle School (6-8)
High School(s)	Medfield Senior High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Dale Street Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	4-5
Year Opened	1942
Existing Square Footage	63,729
Additions	1962 Addition to 1942 structure, 1997 office conversion to educational space and modular classroom installation in 2000.
Acreage of Site	17 acres (shared with Memorial Elementary)

<b>District Information</b>	
Building Issues	<p>The District identified deficiencies in the following areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Structural integrity</li> <li>– Mechanical systems</li> <li>– Electrical systems</li> <li>– Plumbing systems</li> <li>– Envelope</li> <li>– Windows</li> <li>– Roof</li> <li>– Accessibility</li> </ul> <p>In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.</p>
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2020-2021 Enrollment	407
Agreed Upon Enrollment	<p>Study Enrollment includes the following configurations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– 575 students in grades 4-5 (Preferred Schematic)</li> <li>– 860 students in grade 3-5</li> </ul>
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the Preferred Schematic, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 575 students in grades 4-5.
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	December 13, 2017
Invitation to Feasibility Study	December 12, 2018
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On February 11, 2021 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on August 25, 2021.
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	38.94%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	Leftfield LLC
Designer	Arrowstreet Inc.

## Discussion

The existing Dale Street Elementary School is a 63,729 square foot facility located on a 17-acre site shared with the Memorial Elementary School that currently serves students in grades 4-5. The original school building was constructed in 1942, with an addition in 1962, an office converted to educational space in 1997, and modular classrooms installed in 2000.

The District’s Statement of Interest (“SOI”) identifies numerous deficiencies in the existing facility associated with outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope;

accessibility issues; overcrowding; and inappropriate existing spaces for delivering the District’s educational program.

As part of the Feasibility Study, the District explored options that considered a grade reconfiguration to add third grade students, resulting in the following study design enrollments: 575 students for grades 4-5 and 860 students for grades 3-5.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program, and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied (10) preliminary options at the Dale Street Elementary School site and (9) preliminary options at the Wheelock Elementary School site, totaling (19) preliminary options that include: (1) base repair option, (2) addition/renovation options, and (16) new construction options. The following is a list of the preliminary options considered.

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
A	Base repair of the existing Dale Street Elementary School for 575-students in grades 4-5.
B1	Addition/Renovation of the existing Dale Street Elementary School for 575-students in grades 4-5.
B2	Addition/Renovation of the existing Dale Elementary Street School for 860-students in grades 3-5.
C1	New construction for 575-students in grades 4-5 on the existing site, with the demolition of the existing Dale Street Elementary School.
C2	New construction for 860-students in grades 3-5 on the existing site, with the demolition of the existing Dale Street Elementary School.
D1	New construction for 575-students in grades 4-5 on the existing site, while retaining the existing Dale Street Elementary School building.
D2	New construction for 860-students in grades 3-5 on the existing site, while retaining the existing Dale Street Elementary School building.
E1	New construction for 575-students in grades 4-5 on the existing site, while retaining the existing Dale Street Elementary School building.
E1.2	New construction for 575-students in grades 4-5 on the existing site and demolishing the existing Dale Street Elementary School for field area.
E2	New construction for 860-students in grades 3-5. On the existing site, while retaining the existing Dale Street Elementary School building.
E2.2	New construction for 860-students in grades 3-5 on the existing site and demolishing the existing Dale Street Elementary School for field area.
F1	New construction for 575-students in grades 4-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School site.
F2	New construction for 860-students in grades 3-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School site.
G1	New construction for 575-students in grades 4-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School site.
G2	New construction for 860-students in grades 3-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School site.
H1	New construction for 575-students in grades 4-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School

	site.
H2	New construction for 860-students in grades 3-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School site.
J1	New construction for 575-students in grades 4-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School site.
J2	New construction for 860-students in grades 3-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School site.

As a result of this analysis, the District determined that “Option A” was not considered a viable option because it does not meet the needs of the District’s educational program and would result in significant disruption to ongoing education during construction. However, it will be included for cost comparison purposes only. However, this option is included in the final evaluation of alternatives for cost comparison purposes.

Subsequent to the evaluation of the preliminary options, (2) additional options were added “Options E1.3 and E2.3”. Additionally, the District removed the following (10) options from further consideration: “Options C1 and C2”; “Options D1 and D2”; “Options E1.2 and E2.2”, “Options F1 and F2”; and “Options H1 and H2”.

The District determined “Options C1 and C2” would be removed from further consideration because of concerns associated with phasing work required to build in this location, site and phasing impacts ideal adjacencies included in the educational program, and the availability of more desirable alternatives.

The District determined “Options D1 and D2” would be removed from further consideration because the site approach does not provide as much off-street queuing space or as much potential for undivided field space as other options provide.

The District removed “Options E1.2 and E2.2” from further consideration because these options would demolish the existing Dale Street Elementary School building, and the design does not improve parking or playing fields.

The District determined “Options F1 and F2” and “Options H1 and H2” would be removed from further consideration because of concerns that the loop around the existing Wheelock Elementary School would require unnecessary demolition and reconstruction of the existing fields, and because of the availability of more desirable alternatives.

MSBA staff and the District agreed to explore the following (11) options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below, which include: (1) code upgrade option, (2) addition/renovation options, and (8) new construction options. Please note that “Option A” was not considered for further evaluation by the District; however, it has been included for cost comparison purposes only.

**Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options**

<b>Option (Description)</b>	<b>Total Gross Square Feet</b>	<b>Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*</b>	<b>Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Estimated Total Project Costs</b>
Option A: (Code Upgrade) 575 students in grades 4-5 at the existing Dale Street Elementary School.	63,729	63,729 \$435/sq. ft.	N/A	\$3,391,583	\$31,123,153 \$488/sq. ft.	\$38,903,941
Option B1: (Addition/ Renovation) 575 students in grades 4-5 at the existing Dale Street Elementary School.	114,922	36,362 \$435/sq. ft.	78,560 \$549/sq. ft.	\$5,430,377	\$64,355,122 \$560/sq. ft.	\$80,443,903
Option B2: (Addition/ Renovation) 860 students in grades 3-5 at the existing Dale Street Elementary School.	143,642	36,362 \$435/sq. ft.	107,280 \$514/sq. ft.	\$5,253,376	\$76,237,624 \$531/sq. ft.	\$95,297,030
Option E1: (New Construction) 575 students in grades 4-5 at the existing Dale Street Elementary School site.	98,258	N/A	98,258 \$527/sq. ft.	\$6,149,437	\$57,907,802 \$589/sq. ft.	\$72,384,752
Option E1.3: (New Construction) 575 students in grades 4-5 at the existing Dale Street Elementary School site.	98,258	N/A	98,258 \$525/sq. ft.	\$6,043,073	\$57,660,948 \$587/sq. ft.	\$72,075,878
Option E2: (New Construction) 860 students in grades 3-5 at the existing Dale Street Elementary School site.	131,327	N/A	131,327 \$504/sq. ft.	\$6,194,136	\$72,408,814 \$551/sq. ft.	\$90,511,018
Option E2.3: (New Construction) 860 students in grades 3-5 at the existing Dale Street Elementary School site.	131,327	N/A	131,327 \$500/sq. ft.	\$6,043,073	\$71,765,814 \$546/sq. ft.	\$89,707,265

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<b>Option G1: ***</b> <i>(New Construction)</i> 575 students in grades 4-5 at the existing Wheelock Elementary School site.	98,258	N/A	98,258 \$529/sq. ft.	\$9,884,211	\$61,864,846 \$630/sq. ft.	\$77,331,308
Option G2: (New Construction) 860 students in grades 3-5 at the existing Wheelock Elementary School site.	131,327	N/A	131,327 \$507/sq. ft.	\$9,884,211	\$76,488,425 \$582/sq. ft.	\$95,310,782
Option J1: (New Construction) 575 students in grades 4-5 at the existing Wheelock Elementary School site.	98,258	N/A	98,258 \$524/sq. ft.	\$9,629,815	\$61,105,093 \$622/sq. ft.	\$76,381,618
Option J2: (New Construction) 860 students in grades 3-5 at the existing Wheelock Elementary School site.	131,327	N/A	131,327 \$506/sq. ft.	\$9,629,815	\$76,064,739 \$579/sq. ft.	\$95,082,487

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\***District's Preferred Schematic**

The District has selected "Option G1", as its Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected "Option G1" as its preferred option because it best meets the needs of the District's educational program, it incorporates a three-pod academic configuration for each grade, its location on the Wheelock Elementary School site will minimize disruption to ongoing education during construction, and the design better accommodates future expansion should it be required.

"Options B1 and B2" were not selected by the District because ideal adjacencies are compromised to fit existing spaces, construction phasing of an occupied building would result in significant disruption to ongoing education during construction, these options require swing space, and they result in an extended construction schedule.

"Options E1 and E1.3" and "Options E2 and E2.3" were not selected by the District because they require the demolition of the Dale Street Elementary School building and construction phasing of

an occupied building would result in significant disruption to ongoing education during construction.

“Option G2” was not selected by the District because it is not the preferred grade configuration and design enrollment option selected by the District.

“Options J1 and J2” were not selected by the District because they would have a slightly higher construction impact than “Option G1” to the students at the Wheelock Elementary School and would require the existing Wheelock Elementary School bus drop and parking to be relocated during construction.

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on January 20, 2021. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed the following items: appreciation of the District’s educational program; inclusion and location of outdoor learning spaces; and appreciation of the Main Street concept and campus approach included in the design.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s Preferred Schematic is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District’s Special Education submission is subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Medfield be approved to construct a new elementary school facility for grades 4-5 on the Wheelock Elementary School site to replace the existing Dale Street Elementary School.

Staff further recommends that the Town of Medfield:

- 1) Be allowed to consider using the following as potential model school design candidates:
  - a. Andover, Bancroft Elementary School designed by SMMA;
  - b. Burlington Memorial Elementary School designed by Knight, Bagge & Anderson, Inc. who was purchased by Raymond Design Associated in 2018;
  - c. Lexington, Estabrook Elementary School designed by DiNisco Design;

- d. New Bedford, Lincoln Elementary School designed by Mount Vernon Group Architects; and
  - e. Norfolk, Freeman-Kennedy Elementary School designed by Flansburgh Architects.
- 2) If the Town of Medfield chooses to formally evaluate the model school designs listed above as potential model school design candidates, the District will evaluate both the model school designs and the District's Preferred Schematic design ("Option G1") and will proceed with interviews of their respective designers to determine which design best meets the District's educational needs.