

District: Town of Randolph  
 School Name: Elizabeth G. Lyons Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: April 7, 2021

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Randolph (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Elizabeth G. Lyons Elementary School with a new facility serving grades PK-5 on the site of the former Charles G. Devine Elementary School. MSBA staff accepts the District’s Preferred Schematic, contingent upon the District gaining full ownership, control, and exclusive use of the proposed site.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	Town of Randolph
Elementary School(s)	Elizabeth G. Lyons Elementary (K-5) J F Kennedy Elementary (PK-5) Margaret L. Donovan (K-5) Martin E. Young Elementary (K-5)
Middle School(s)	Randolph Community Middle (6-8)
High School(s)	Randolph High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Elizabeth G. Lyons Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	K-5
Year Opened	1957
Existing Square Footage	38,000 sq ft
Additions	N/A
Acreage of Site	4.8 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– HVAC systems</li> <li>– Electrical systems</li> <li>– Plumbing systems</li> <li>– Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	210
2020-2021 Enrollment	297
Agreed Upon Enrollment	315
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 315 students for grades K-5, for a project that will serve grades PK-5
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	December 13, 2017
Invitation to Feasibility Study	April 10, 2019
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On April 14, 2021 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on October 27, 2021
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	76.84%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner's Project Manager (the "OPM")	CHA Companies
Designer	TSKP Studios

## Discussion

The existing Elizabeth G. Lyons Elementary School is a 38,000 square foot facility located on a 4.8-acre site that currently serves grades K-5.

The original school building was constructed in 1957. The District's Statement of Interest ("SOI") identified numerous deficiencies in the existing facility associated with outdated HVAC, electrical, and plumbing systems, accessibility issues, and projected overcrowding. In addition, the District has indicated that the existing facility does not support the delivery of the District's education plan due to undersized academic spaces.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied five (5) preliminary options that included one (1) code upgrade/base repair option, one (1) addition/renovation configuration and three (3) new construction options. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary options considered.

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
1	Base Repair/Code upgrade; with an estimated total project cost of \$16 million.
2	Addition/Renovation option; with an estimated total project cost of \$53 million.
3	New Construction on the existing Lyons School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$49.4 million.
4	New Construction on the existing Lyons School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$62.3 million.
5	New Construction on the existing Devine School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$50.2 million.

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to explore all five (5) options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below.

### Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 1: Base Repair/ Code Upgrade	35,795	35,795 \$337/sq. ft.	0 \$0/sq. ft.	\$1,104,400	\$13,173,167 \$368/sq. ft.	\$15,900,000
Option 2: Addition/ Renovation	82,000	26,142 \$414/sq. ft.	55,858 \$414/sq. ft.	\$8,560,412	\$42,516,804 \$519/sq. ft.	\$51,400,000
Option 3: New Construction on Lyons Site	76,575	0 \$0/sq. ft.	76,575 \$400/sq. ft.	\$8,863,906	\$39,527,244 \$516/sq. ft.	\$47,800,000
Option 4: New Construction on Lyons Site	76,700	0 \$0/sq. ft.	76,700 \$417/sq. ft.	\$10,404,978	\$42,408,056 \$553/sq. ft.	\$51,300,000
<b>Option 5: New Construction on Devine Site***</b>	<b>76,700</b>	<b>0</b> <b>\$0/sq. ft.</b>	<b>76,700</b> <b>\$412/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$8,563,811</b>	<b>\$40,162,241</b> <b>\$524/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$48,600,000</b>

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\*District's Preferred Schematic

The District has selected “Option 5”, new construction on the site of the former Devine Elementary School, as the Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design. The former Devine School site is relatively flat with less restrictions than the existing school site, can be accessed via public transportation, and as an unoccupied site includes no anticipated disruption to students. The preferred solution is reported to support the District’s educational goals and is envisioned as a key asset for the Randolph community for after-school use and to reconnect the community to its heritage through preservation and highlighting of historic and architecturally significant elements of the Devine School building and site features in the proposed project that would otherwise remain hidden. This option has the lowest project cost of the options studied that support the design enrollment and educational goals of the District.

“Option 1” was not selected because the District determined that the existing building is insufficient to support the design enrollment and does not support the District’s educational program.

Although “Option 2” meets the requirements of the District’s educational program and provides the spaces needed to support the design enrollment and pre-kindergarten program, this option was not selected because it included undesired construction phasing in an occupied school leading to a longer construction duration and was determined to be the most disruptive of all the options studied. The District also found that due to the condition of the existing building, the estimated cost associated with this option would exceed the cost of the new construction options studied.

Although “Option 3” meets the requirements of the educational program and has the lowest cost of the options studied that meet the District’s requirements, it was not selected as the Preferred

Schematic. Concern regarding the soil conditions, site constraints, and the challenges associated with building adjacent to an operating school resulted in this option being considered less desirable than the Preferred Schematic.

The District did not select “Option 4” as it required temporary swing space, was considered disruptive to student learning, and was more costly than the Preferred Schematic.

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on March 24, 2021. At that meeting, FAS members discussed a number of items including: the importance of plans for professional development as it relates to the proposed changes to teaching methodology; an appreciation of the Educational Program; location and distribution of Special Education classrooms, and requirement of upcoming Special Education review by DESE; the proposed number of sinks in each classroom; area of site dedicated to parking, the number of parking spaces required and location of parking relative to the building; shelter and access to the building for individuals with limited mobility; aesthetic features of the building (particularly the glazing on the gym); understanding students and their needs; and consideration of a looping teaching method with grade levels to foster consistency.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s Preferred Schematic is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District’s Special Education submission will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Randolph be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Elizabeth G. Lyons Elementary School with a new facility serving grades PK-5 on the site of the former Charles G. Devine Elementary School, contingent upon the District gaining full ownership, control, and exclusive use of the proposed site.